DETAILED ASSESSMENT

Background

This attachment provides a summary of the proposal and a detailed analysis of the proposal against strategic planning considerations, including relevant State and local planning strategies and legislative requirements.

The Site and Locality

The site is located within the Castlecrag local centre, on the corner of Edinburgh Road and Eastern Valley Way. The site is a prominent entry point to the Castlecrag suburb and adjoins the Griffin Heritage Conservation Area. The Quadrangle shopping centre currently occupies the site.

Summary of Proposal

The existing LEP zone is B1 Neighbourhood Centre, with a strip at the rear of the site zoned RE1 Public Recreation. • The Planning Proposal is seeking the following LEP amendments to allow a mixed use development on the site:

- Include an additional permitted land use of "residential flat building" on the site, specifying that land uses facing Edinburgh Road should be non-residential and that a minimum of 20% of total floorspace should be non-residential uses.
- Proposed FSR of 1.8:1, which includes a maximum of FSR of 1.6:1 for the development above Edinburgh Road.
- Heights increased across the site from the current 9m maximum to a site specific clause. The site specific clause proposes a maximum building height not greater than AHD 97.49 which equates to 11m above Edinburgh Road level and 15.8 m above southern boundary.
- Additional height is to be permitted for various specified roof top facilities including a lift tower being a maximum 4.5m above the roof finished floor level.
- Maintain the existing RE1 strip (Lot 1 DP 43691) at the rear of the site as part of the pedestrian access way linking to The Postern.

Site specific DCP provisions are included with the proposal as follows:

- Site planning, including building height, public open space, setbacks, landscape and tree preservation.
- Development controls, including public and communal open space, private open space, building materials and colours, setbacks and visual privacy.

The concept proposal is for a mixed-use development comprising retail/commercial uses and housing units. The essential characteristics of the proposal are:

- Total site area of 5,168 m2 in single ownership (includes land zoned RE 1 Public Recreation).
- Two storey pavilions above a ground level base storey, equating to a three storey development on Edinburgh Road and four storey development at the rear.

- Total GFA of 9,300m2 comprising 1,740m2 retail and commercial space, 6,260m2 of residential apartments and the balance including corridor areas.
- 53 apartments with a mix of 4% one bedroom, 55% two bedroom and 42% threebedroom units.
- Half of all units are capable of meeting the adaptable housing standard.
- Public and communal open space of 2,220m2, including approximately 750m2 of landscaped plaza along the northern boundary of the site adjoining Edinburgh Road.

DISCUSSION

Consideration of planning aspects of the proposal and the major impacts are outlined below. The primary Council planning strategy relevant to the proposal is the *Willoughby Local Centres Strategy*. The proposal is considered further below in relation to the *Strategy*.

Willoughby Local Centres Strategy

As noted in the *Willoughby Local Centres Strategy*, the subdivision and layout of Castlecrag was designed by Walter Burley Griffin and the south eastern side of the centre is within the Griffin Conservation Area. The local centre sits on a ridgeline with wide views across the district.

The Griffin Conservation Area includes part of the local centre on the southern side of Edinburgh Road (adjacent to but not including the Quadrangle site). The centre has a predominantly one to two storey built form character with a fine grain street frontage. The built form of the conservation area has a strong heritage character, referencing the original vision for Castlecrag. The centre offers north-facing cafes and associated outdoor dining, complemented by retractable awnings on the southern side of the street and consistent fixed awnings to the north.

The centre has been recently improved with new large unit Urban Stone paving, planting and street furniture. Generally, improvements include additional street trees and planting on the southern side of Edinburgh Road.

There is a strong desire within the community to retain the integrity of the design philosophy of Walter Burley Griffin for Castlecrag.

The vision for Castlecrag as stated in the Local Centres Strategy is as follows:

"The Castlecrag local centre is a thriving historic shopping village in an attractive landscaped setting and offers a range of outdoor spaces for dining and gathering along Edinburgh Road. New development has enhanced the existing scale and pleasant public domain and has reinforced the character of the Conservation Area and strengthened the Walter Burley Griffin legacy."

The *Local Centres Strategy* envisaged that some additional height could be considered in relation to The Quadrangle site. General recommendations for the centre include:

- Retain the existing B1 Neighbourhood Centre and R3 Medium Density Residential zones for the centre.
- Introduce a minimum non-residential FSR control in the B1 zone.
- Introduce an active ground floor frontage control in the B1 zone.
- Concentrate increased height to the south of Edinburgh Road to minimise solar access and amenity impacts. Minimum 3m upper level setback (2nd storey) for shop

top housing.

- Provide a new publicly accessible open space within the Quadrangle site relating to the Edinburgh Road frontage and achieving good solar access. This may be achieved by providing a setback in the order of 3.5 4m along the frontage of the site.
- Increase heights up to 4 storeys on Eastern Valley Way and up to 3 storeys above Edinburgh Road with an FSR up to 1.6:1 on the Quadrangle site.
- An FSR could be considered to 1.8:1 with an additional storey below the Edinburgh Road frontage to utilise the topography of the site without adversely impacting the streetscape and scale of the centre.

For The Quadrangle site, the site specific clause in the Planning Proposal proposes a maximum building height not greater than AHD 97.49 which equates to 11m above Edinburgh Road level and 15.8 m above southern boundary. The proposed FSR is 1.8:1 with an FSR of not more than 1.6:1 above Edinburgh Road.

In respect to FSR and building height the proposed development is consistent with the *Local Centres Strategy*. Further information in relation to building height and setbacks was requested, and is addressed in the section below.

In relation to the issue of modelling the cumulative impact of the increase in floor space projected under the *Local Centres Strategy* (LCS), it is noted that this concept proposal will be less than the total projected additional residential floor space (6,665sqm) noted under the LCS for the Castlecrag centre, as this proposal is for an additional 6,260 sqm of residential floor space.

The concept proposal will result in a net loss of commercial floor space – the existing Quadrangle Centre is 2,552sm² in area, while this proposal will have a total of 1,740m2 retail. The study by SGS prepared for the LCS forecasts an additional 1,527sqm of non-residential floor space in the Castlecrag centre. This additional floor space may be provided by the redevelopment of other sites elsewhere within the centre, such as part of the shops on the northern side of Edinburgh Road.

Urban Design, Height and Built Form Massing

In response to the requirements of the *Local Centres Strategy*, justification for the proposed variations with the Strategy was requested to be provided in relation to the height of the building at the rear and the upper storey building setbacks. A copy of the additional information provided by the applicant is contained at **Attachment 4**. Part of the information provided is outlined below:

- The concept proposal includes an intention to provide a public right-of-way of an average width of 8m along Edinburgh Road, beyond the public footway.

- The concept proposal states that there is additional overshadowing impact on the rear of the adjoining buildings to the south. Sunlight does penetrate between the two wings to the backyards of adjoining dwellings for a limited time at midwinter's day. However, the additional overshadowing is a consequence of any redevelopment of the site in accordance with the Strategy. It is also noted that the trees on the southern boundary (to be largely retained) already have an overshadowing impact on buildings to the south. Therefore the proponents have stated that the additional overshadowing from the concept proposal will be minor.

- the proposal states that all but two living trees, one of which is failing, on the southern boundary and all the trees on the frontages to Eastern Valley Way and Edinburgh Road will be retained.

As this is a Planning Proposal, building form, detail and character will not be considered in detail, however consideration has been given to the building setting, scale, mass and proposed base articulation and configuration.

It is considered that adequate justification for consistency with the Strategy has been provided in relation to height, bulk and scale and building setbacks. In particular the following matters have been adequately addressed:

- in relation to rear building height of 15.8m, this is determined (in part) by floor to underside of structure in basement of 4.5m to accommodate garbage trucks plus retail floor to ceiling height of 3.6m
- the applicant's drawings show that the rear boundary setbacks are from 6.0m near the south west site corner to 9.5m at the south western corner of the western pavilion. For the eastern pavilion, the setback varies 6.0m to 7.5m, measured from the rear boundary of the houses to the south. On average, the setbacks meet the WDCP.
- demonstration of minimal additional overshadowing impact to private properties to the south has been provided. The applicant has stated that any additional upper storey rear setback is not required in the LCS and any benefit will be minor.

It is considered that the proposal demonstrates adequate consistency with the *Willoughby Local Centres Strategy*. It is also noted the extensive community engagement undertaken and support that was obtained by Council in developing and finalising the Strategy.

The concept proposal has demonstrated general consistency or potential consistency with the provisions of Willoughby DCP and the criteria of SEPP 65 and the Apartment Design Guidelines (ADG). Additional information has been provided at **Attachment 4** on this issue.

It is recognised that this site will have a prominent visual impact on the context of the Castlecrag suburb, and its busy Eastern Valley Way frontage. It is not unreasonable to consider that any development, of prominent scale, will visibly and clearly define a western edge and entry to Castlecrag. A Visual Impact Assessment has been provided with the proposal at **Attachment 3**.

As the site is a prominent entry point to Castlecrag and the Griffin Heritage Conservation Area it is also important that it is developed in a way that aligns with the scale and nature of materials associated with the architecture of Walter Burley Griffin and Marion Mahoney. This issue is addressed in the draft DCP at **Attachment 5**.

Landscape and Vegetation management

The design rationale provided is comprehensive and addresses important landscape integration principles that have guided the design.

The planning proposal indicates that the majority of mature trees will be retained. The concept plan for the building has been located so as to provide adequate protection to the existing trees. The arborist report states that measures will be put in place to ensure that existing trees will be protected. Existing street trees on Edinburgh Road and mature trees to the southern boundary are proposed to be, protected, managed and maintained. A total of four dead (or dying) trees are proposed to be removed. An additional tree is proposed to be removed as a result of the new development. This tree will be replaced in the landscape plans.

Controls for the protection of existing trees and their root zones have also been included in the draft DCP (refer Fig. 5 Tree Preservation Plan)

The revised Arborist's report (Attachment 4) states that the proposed development will retain all of the street trees located along Edinburgh Road, Eastern Valley Way and all but one healthy tree on the southern boundary of the site. It also concludes the following:

"Three of the four trees identified to be removed are dead, with the other trees are 90% dead - also recommended for removal,(sic).

The trees located on the southern boundary are all located at the bottom of an existing retaining wall and will not be impacted from demolition works for the proposed development. The retention of these trees is possible as the proposed plans have been developed with arboriculturist input. Suitable replacement trees are included in the landscape plans.

The area's streetscape amenity will not be altered it and will be enhanced from the new building. Suitable replacement tree plantings in the landscape plan provide further amenity in the area. The trees impacted by the proposed development were planted when the site was developed, and the majority of the trees are not endemic to the area. The retention of as many trees as is possible is important to the community and has been achieved by these plans".

Wind Impact Assessment

At the request of Council a preliminary Wind Impact Assessment has been undertaken relating to the concept plan to address prevailing winds and relevant controls included in the draft DCP for this proposal.

This report presents an overview on the likely impact of the proposed Quadrangle development located at 100 Edinburgh Road, Castlecrag on the local wind environment at the critical outdoor areas within and around the subject site. The effect of wind activity has been examined for the three predominant wind directions for the region, namely the north-easterly, southerly, and westerly winds. The analysis of the wind effects relating to the proposed development have been carried out in the context of the local wind climate, building morphology and land topography.

No wind tunnel testing has been undertaken for the subject development, and hence this report addresses only the general wind effects and any localised effects that are identifiable by visual inspection of the architectural drawings provided (received 17 September 2020 and 24 September 2020). Any recommendations in this report are made only in-principle and are based on experience in the study of wind environment effects.

The results of this assessment indicate that the development has incorporated several design features and wind mitigating strategies and is expected to be suitable for the intended use for the majority of the outdoor trafficable areas. However, there are some areas that are exposed to the prevailing winds. It is expected that the wind effects identified in the report can be ameliorated with the consideration of the following

treatment strategies into the design of the development:

Ground Level Trafficable Areas

- Retention of the existing and proposed trees and landscaping along Edinburgh Road.
- Retention of the proposed support columns along the northern façade of the development.
- Retention of the existing trees at the south of the site.
- Retention of the existing trees along Eastern Valley Way.

Level 3 Communal Rooftop Terrace

- Retention of perimeter landscaping.
- Private Balconies and Terraces
- Inclusion of 1.5-2m staggered planters on the Level 2 western balcony.
- Retention of standard height impermeable balustrades on corner balconies.

The assessment notes that for the landscaping to be effective in wind mitigation throughout the year, plant species are to be of a densely foliating evergreen species.

With the inclusion of the above recommendations in the final design, it is expected that wind conditions for the various trafficable outdoor areas within and around the development will be suitable for their intended uses and their applicable criteria.

Acoustic assessment

It is noted that an acoustic assessment will be required at development application stage given the proposed development includes residential units adjoining a major road (Eastern Valley Way) as triggered by *SEPP Infrastructure*.

Heritage impact

The subject site adjoins the Griffin Heritage Conservation Area along its eastern and part southern boundary and is in the vicinity of three (3) heritage items being, 10 The Postern (Community Centre - I48), 136 Edinburgh Road (House - I13) and 140 Edinburgh Road (House - I15). All three (3) heritage items are important for the Griffin area and are listed as having "local significance" in the Willoughby LEP 2012.

In support of the Planning Proposal, the applicant has submitted a Heritage Impact Statement, prepared by Weir Phillips, Heritage and Planning, with a supplementary report on Walter Burley Griffin's Legacy prepared by Heritage21.

The proposed concept development for the mixed use development is considered to be generally acceptable from a heritage point of view, subject to the existing trees being retained. The retention of the trees around the site will provide adequate screening to the adjoining properties and the heritage conservation area as is appropriate.

The proposed development is unlikely to have any adverse impact on the listed heritage items in the vicinity, due to the distance from the subject site and/or topography of the land. The retention of the majority of the trees will also assist to

manage any visual impact of the proposed development on the nearby heritage conservation area.

The trees are essential from a heritage point of view to protect and continue the landscape character of the adjoining heritage conservation area. The subject site is the entry point to the conservation area and requires to be treated as such.

The materials and colours of the proposed development are also very important and should be considered carefully in the development. The applicant has prepared an indicative palette of materials and finishes to be incorporated in the site specific DCP. Materials and colours must blend inconspicuously with the predominant colours of the local bushland. Locally indigenous vegetation is to be used for the landscaped areas, including private open spaces. These issues have been given due consideration in the draft DCP and will be considered in any subsequent development applications following the Planning Proposal.

Transport and Traffic Impact Assessment

It is noted that the site is located adjacent to a number of public transport (bus) stops, with good access to North Sydney Station and Chatswood Station (and Metro). The development proposal is located in an accessible and highly walkable location.

Overall, the concept proposal is unlikely to have significant impact on the surrounding road network. Traffic generation from the commercial component of the proposal will not significantly differ from the existing, similar-sized Quadrangle shopping centre.

Transport for NSW was previously consulted on the planning proposal submitted in 2020. It is anticipated that Transport for NSW will be consulted again at public exhibition stage. At the request of Council and Transport for NSW, a more detailed traffic and transport report was provided to support the earlier planning proposal and inform the draft DCP and any future development application. A copy of the previous Transport for NSW (TfNSW) response is at **Attachment 7**.

The updated traffic report has been provided with the Planning Proposal and it addresses the following:

- Cumulative traffic effects (both residential and retail uses)
- Site access
- Car Park and Loading Dock Design to Comply with Australian Standards.

The additional traffic impact will be from the residential component of the proposal. The traffic assessment forecasts an additional 10 vehicles per hour (two-way) in the weekday morning and 8 additional movements in the afternoon peak periods due to the new residential component. This would have a minimal impact on the Level of Service (LoS) of the Eastern Valley Way / Edinburgh Road intersection.

The revised traffic report has (in part) stated the following:

The planning proposal for the Quadrangle site envisages some 53 residential units and a decrease of some 772m2 in retail area. Applying the same generation rates as used in the TTP, the 53 residential units would generate an additional 10 vehicles per hour (two way) in the AM peak hour and an additional 8 vehicles per hour in the PM peak hour. Setting aside the decrease in retail area, the additional AM/PM peak hour traffic generated by the planning proposal (10 and 8 vehicles per hour, two way) is less than that assumed for the Quadrangle site in the TTP report for Castlecrag (17 and 25 vehicles per hour, two way). Thus the cumulative traffic effects of the planning proposal with other future development in Castlecrag have been considered in the TTP report. With regards to queuing on Edinburgh Road at the site access, the minor increase in traffic entering the site in the AM/PM peak hours (4 and 7 vehicles per hour in the AM/PM peak hours respectively) would have a negligible impact".

Generally, it is concluded by the applicant that the parking demand of the proposal is met on site and that the traffic generated will have only a minor impact upon the local traffic system and the intersection of Eastern Valley Way and Edinburgh Road.

Further traffic matters to note on the proposal include:

- The additional traffic generation will be relatively small and it will have a negligible impact on the Eastern Valley Way/Edinburgh Rd intersection. Although the intersection is already at a poor Level of Service (LoS), this development will only make it slightly worse.
- The largest vehicle that will access the site is proposed to be a 8.8m long medium rigid vehicle (MRV). It is noted that the design of the car park/access is proposed to only cater for such a vehicle. Given it will be a moderately sized supermarket similar to the existing, this approach seems reasonable.
- Compliance with relevant Australian Standards for car park/access design can be confirmed on plans with any future DA.
- Further design details for the carpark and access design can be considered at DA stage, such as a small raised kerb at the driveway entry to separate the entry and exit paths.
- **Car parking**: It is noted 157 car spaces are proposed to be provided in the development. According to the traffic review, a minimum of 147 car parking spaces are required for the proposed development using existing parking rates from Willoughby Development Control Plan (WDCP). According to Council calculations, a minimum of 156 spaces are required
- **Motorcycle parking**: Parking for motorcycles is proposed at Council's DCP rate of 1 motorcycle space per 25 car parking spaces, which would result in 6 motorcycle spaces required. This is supported and can be confirmed at DA stage including on the revised plans.
- **Bicycle parking and end-of-trip facilities (EOTF) and Green Travel Plan**: Indicative calculations for bicycle parking based on Council's existing WDCP rates are given in point 8 of the traffic review. Conversion of some parking spaces to storage cages (which could double as bike storage) may be suggested. The provisional Green Travel Plan provided in the Planning Proposal report is a welcome addition and can be further detailed at DA stage.
- Access to Eastern Valley Way: Willoughby Local Centres Strategy includes an indicative master plan for Castlecrag that includes item 14: "Potential for a new leftout (or service) access from the Quadrangle". Point 12 of the traffic review states this is not supported by TfNSW. Council supports this position, given the sight distances and potential for conflict with the driveway to the multi-dwelling residential property to the south (99 Eastern Valley Way).
- Access / loading arrangements: Access is proposed to be retained from Edinburgh Road and this is supported. The use of a turntable for a MRV is not a preferred solution, particularly given the plans appear to show adequate space is available for physical truck movements in this location. If a turntable is demonstrated to be the most feasible and practical option, greater justification will be required at DA stage and will need to address any potential safety issues that may arise between vehicle, cyclist and pedestrian movements. A management plan would also be required for the use of the turntable at DA stage. The smaller loading dock for a SRV (e.g.

removalist trucks) for residential use is also supported, noting no turntable is required for this bay.

Electric vehicles (EVs): Spaces and charging points for EVs should be given proper consideration and shown on revised plans as part of any future DA. The proponent would be aware that the draft WDCP will include controls relating to this matter.

Contamination assessment

A Preliminary Site Contamination Investigation has been undertaken for the planning proposal being reported to Council.

This report has considered the prior use of the land, including the use as a service station, together with the likelihood of the presence of fill material on the site and the risk that this fill might be contaminated, and the presence of asbestos and other hazardous materials. A preliminary site investigation report has been prepared. Having regard to site history, there is an assessed moderate risk of contamination which will need to be the subject of a detail site investigation at development application stage.

Management of Stormwater

Stormwater drainage management plans, incorporating water quality systems and onsite detention systems complying with part C.5 of the Willoughby DCP including Technical Standards No. 1 will be required to be submitted with any future DA for the site.

The applicants have stated (**Attachment 4**) that a detailed stormwater management design will be an essential part of the development application. The applicants have also noted that there will be little change to the area of stormwater collection from that existing and that the site has the benefit of connection to the street system by gravity.

Management and zoning of public open space

There is an existing public access way zoned RE1 Public Recreation along the southern boundary of the site and linking through to The Postern. The plans show that this is proposed to be extended with a "public right-of-way" and landscaped area linking through the site to Edinburgh Road.

Further information was requested regarding the future intended ownership and management of this "public open space" as identified on sheet 6007 (public open space area of 1150m2 including approximately 750m2 of landscaped plaza along the northern boundary of the site adjoining Edinburgh Road). This included whether there is any proposed change to the existing RE1 Public Recreation zone link to the site (existing public pathway).

The following matters are also noted by Council officers for consideration in the development of the concept proposal and the draft DCP as well as subsequent development applications:

• Edinburgh Road frontage has limited footpath width between the existing street furniture/vegetation and the current boundary. Pedestrians currently use both the current public footpath and the private land in the vicinity as the existing buildings are set back from the boundary. If the development were to restrict public access to the public roadway only, as currently landscaped, there would not be the width required for a footpath. A footpath width available for use that is 2.4m or wider as determined by the pedestrian load of the area and that generated by the development will be required. This may require a public right of way into private land. Any potential outdoor eating areas should be clear of

this footway area. Appropriate DCP provisions have been provided addressing this.

- Reconstruction of the streetscape should occur. A public domain landscape plan should be included as a DCP requirement for review by Council. The bus stop in front of the development needs to be a Disability Standards for Accessible Public Transport 2002 (DSAPT) compliant bus stop.
- Any public right of way over private land should be for the public to use but is to be maintained and renewed, insured etc. by the private land holder. Council should not have any responsibilities or liabilities on the private land. This public right of way should be compliant for disabled access and give consideration to Safer By Design principles and guidelines.
- The rear pathway from The Postern (between No.3 and No.5) should be upgraded to a minimum width of 1.5m with a desirable width of 1.8m (for passing wheelchairs). At the moment there are makeshift stairs on private land that provide access to the site from this pathway. This access should be upgraded to allow for disabled access.

The proponents have stated that the public outdoor eating area is contiguous with the public right of way but not part of it. Construction and maintenance of the public right of way over the site is to be the responsibility of the applicant and subject to a publicly accessible area management plan to be agreed with Council. No change to the existing RE1 Public Recreation zone is proposed.

Reconstruction of the footway and the making accessible of the bus stop are part of the public domain works which can be detailed in the DA and, where appropriate, negotiated through the Voluntary Planning Agreement (VPA). Upgrade of the rear pathway will also be considered further as part of the VPA.

Draft Development Control Plan (DCP)

A draft DCP has been submitted for Council consideration to apply to the site (see **Attachment 5**).

The draft DCP has provided objectives and controls for the proposed development on the site, including for the following:

- Masterplan
- Building form and height,
- Open space subject to a public right-of-way
- Building setbacks
- Landscaping and tree preservation
- Communal open space
- Private open space
- Solar access
- Visual privacy

• Materials and colours,

It is recommended that the reference to the nominated architect and design competition in the DCP should be excluded from the DCP, as the choice of architect is a matter for the developer not Council. Further, the project will be subject to Council's *Design Excellence Policy*. It is also noted that where matters are not covered by site specific provisions, the remainder of the *Willoughby Development Control Plan* will apply to the site. Specific recommendations in relation to management of the public open space on private land are also proposed in the draft DCP.

Design excellence

It is acknowledged that there are a number of aspects of the proposal that have design merit, noting that the proposed concept design provided with the Planning Proposal is the outcome of a proponent initiated design competition and community consultation. However it is intended that should the Planning Proposal be supported, it is proposed that the *Willoughby LEP 2012 Design Excellence Clause* will apply to the site, with implementation undertaken in accordance with the *Willoughby City Council Design Excellence Policy (Guidelines*).

The proponent has indicated that they support the site being subject to the *Design Excellence Clause*, noting the fact that the proponents have had their own design excellence competition.

Proposed Voluntary Planning Agreement (VPA)

There are some items that may be considered in relation to a future VPA, including:

- public domain improvements in the Castlecrag local centre,
- streetscape, including rear access to the site,
- open space on site,
- public end of trip facilities
- public art contribution
- on-site public parking contribution (8 spaces)

Further information has been provided in the form of a draft VPA. This will enable for the matter of public benefit to be considered fully by Council and enable exhibition of the draft VPA in conjunction with the draft Planning Proposal and DCP. The draft VPA is the subject of a separate report to Council.

Department of Planning and Environment Requirements

The Planning Proposal is generally consistent with accordance with the requirements under Clause 33.3 of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979 and the Department of Planning's requirements set out in "*A guide to preparing planning proposals*" (October 2012). This document establishes six parts for consideration of a Planning Proposal which are addressed below:

PART 1 – OBJECTIVES OR INTENDED OUTCOMES

The objective of this planning proposal is to facilitate the development of a mixed-use development in the Castlecrag neighbourhood centre. The development will include commercial and residential uses with associated public domain improvements and additional car parking.

PART 2 – EXPLANATION OF PROVISIONS

The Department of Planning and Environment provided a gateway determination on 13 April 2022. Conditions of the gateway included the following matters being addressed prior to public exhibition of the proposal:

(a) provide clarification as to what is proposed on the land zoned RE1 Public Recreation.

(b) in the objectives and intended outcomes section, provide a plain English explanation of the outcome that is intended to be achieved including the type and scale of development expected on the site and the number of storeys, jobs and dwellings.

(c) provide a clear explanation of the provisions sought to be amended by the planning proposal and incorporate the proposed changes outlined in the Council resolution.

(d) the additional permitted use of residential flat building for land at 100 Edinburgh Road Castlecrag should be limited only to the B1 Neighbourhood Centre zoned land on Lot 11, DP611594.

(e) provide discussion on the relationship with the draft exhibited Willoughby Comprehensive Local Environmental Plan planning proposal and clarify updates to the draft controls in the planning proposal.

(f) update the 9.1 Ministerial Directions to refer to the most recently issued directions (1 March 2022) and as follows:

a. remove reference to revoked former Direction 7.1 Implementation of a Plan for Growing Sydney;

b. address all relevant directions including the following:

i. 4.4 Remediation of Contaminated Land;

ii. 4.5 Acid and Sulfate Soils as the site is within a 500m buffer zone of an area classified as "Class 2"; and

iii. 5.2 Reserving Land for a public purpose

c. provide further justification for the inconsistency with: i. 1.4 Site Specific Provisions as the increased height and FSR are to be provided by site-specific provisions; and ii. 7.1 Business and Industrial Zones as the employment

floorspace is to be reduced by approximately 812m2.

(g) for the SEPPs:

a. address the following consolidated SEPPs:

i. SEPP (Housing) 2021

ii. SEPP (Biodiversity and Conservation) 2021;

iii. SEPP (Resilience and Hazards) 2021; and

iv. SEPP (Transportation and Infrastructure) 2021;

b. remove reference to the following repealed SEPPs and SREP: i. SEPP (Affordable Rental Housing) 2009:

ii. SEPP 70 – Affordable Housing (Revised Schemes); and

iii. SEPP (Housing for Seniors or People with a Disability) 2004.

iv. SEPP 19 – Bushland in Urban Areas;

v. SREP (Sydney Harbour Catchment) 2005;

vi. SEPP 55 Remediation of Land; and

vii. SEPP (Infrastructure) 2007.

(h) include an assessment of the proposal against the relevant priorities and actions of the Council endorsed Willoughby Local Housing Strategy and remove references to the 'draft' version of these strategies.
(i) include an advisory note referencing the Employment Zones Reform Framework and noting the proposed translation of employment zones as it relates to the proposed amendments. Include a table within the planning proposal that clearly demonstrates the information required in the table template for changes within an industrial or business zone for each of the following options:

i. the amendment or introduction of a local provision; and

ii. Schedule 1 Additional Permitted Uses.

(*j*) update the draft mapping in the spatial viewer for the purposes of exhibition including:

i. the provision of a base maximum height of buildings and base maximum FSR maps and reference to clauses 4.3A Exceptions to height of buildings and 4.4A Exceptions to floor space ratio for additional controls; and

ii. the existing and proposed Special Provisions Area map to indicate that the land is subject to Clause 6.8 Affordable housing and 6.23 Design excellence for certain sites in Willoughby.

(k) remove reference to Clause 6.24 as this clause has been taken up in another planning proposal.

(I) include a project timeline based on the Gateway determination date.

Response to Gateway Determination

The conditions established by the gateway determination have been addressed in the sections below:

The outcome proposed in the Planning Proposal will be achieved by preparing an amendment to WLEP2012, which will include:

- Increase to 1.8:1 FSR from the current 1:1, with a maximum FSR of 1.6:1 for the building above the Edinburgh Road level.
- Heights increased across the site from the current 9m maximum to a site specific clause. The site specific clause proposes a maximum building height not greater than AHD 97.49 which equates to 11m above Edinburgh Road level and 15.8 m above southern boundary of the site. The development proposed will result in a building of three storeys high on Edinburgh Road and four storeys at the rear.
- Additional height is to be permitted for various specified roof top facilities including a lift tower being a maximum 4.5m above the roof finished floor level.

- Include an additional permitted land use of "residential flat building" on the site (ie Lot 11 DP 611594), specifying that land uses facing Edinburgh Road should be non-residential and that a minimum of 20% of total floorspace should be non-residential uses.
- Maintain the existing RE1 strip (Lot 1 DP 43691) at the rear of the site as part of the pedestrian access way linking to The Postern.

The concept proposal is for a mixed-use development comprising retail/commercial uses and housing units. The essential characteristics of the proposal are:

- Total site area of 5,168 m2 in single ownership.
- Two storey pavilions above a ground level base storey, equating to a three storey development on Edinburgh Road and four storey development at the rear.
- Total GFA of 9,300m2 comprising 1,740m2 retail and commercial space, 6,260m2 of residential apartments and the balance including corridor areas.
- 53 apartments with a mix of 4% one bedroom, 55% two bedroom, and 42% threebedroom units.
- Half of all units are capable of meeting the adaptable housing standard.
- Public and communal open space of 2,220m2, including approximately 750m2 of landscaped plaza along the northern boundary of the site adjoining Edinburgh Road.
- In relation to the number of jobs created as a result of the development, it is estimated that the development, upon completion, will provide 90 retail jobs and up to 18 service contractors associated with the residential part of the development.

Draft Willoughby Local Environmental Plan (Comprehensive LEP 2022)

The gateway determination (dated 13 April 2022) required further discussion on the relationship with the *Comprehensive LEP* as per the following:

(e) provide discussion on the relationship with the draft exhibited Willoughby Comprehensive Local Environmental Plan planning proposal and clarify updates to the draft controls in the planning proposal.

The *Draft Willoughby Local Environmental Plan 2022 (WLEP - PP-2021-6242)* has been on public exhibition from 5 March until 7 June 2022. The *Comprehensive LEP* proposes the following in relation to FSR and building height the site (100 Edinburgh Road):

(13) The maximum Floor Space Ratio on land identified as "Area 4" (being 100 Edinburgh Road, Castlecrag) on the Floor Space Ratio Map may exceed 1.6:1 if —

(a) additional floorspace is located below the Edinburgh Road frontage and

(b) the FSR will not exceed 1.8:1 and the building does not exceed the height on the Height of Building Map.

The draft Height of Building Map for the site proposes a maximum building height of 11m for the front half of the site adjacent to Edinburgh Road, with a maximum building height of 14m being permitted on the rear half of the site. The proposed changes in the Comprehensive LEP that apply to this site and Castlecrag local centre are illustrated in the diagram below:



This planning proposal for 100 Edinburgh Road is considered to be broadly consistent with the *Comprehensive LEP* as it proposes to:

- Increase to 1.8:1 FSR from the current 1:1, with a maximum FSR of 1.6:1 for the building above the Edinburgh Road level.
- Heights increased across the site from the current 9m maximum to a site-specific clause. The site-specific clause proposes a maximum building height not greater than AHD 97.49 which equates to 11m above Edinburgh Road level and 15.8 m above southern boundary of the site.
- Include an additional permitted land use of "residential flat building" on the site, specifying that land uses facing Edinburgh Road at ground level should be non-residential and that a minimum of 20% of total floorspace should be non-residential uses.

While it is noted that while the maximum rear building height exceeds the *Comprehensive LEP* building height for the southern part of the site, it is considered that this minor variation is justified, taking into account the sloping site and uneven terrain. The building height provisions exclude a number of specified rooftop features including a lift access structure being a maximum of 4.5m above the roof top level.

The proposed FSR provisions for both proposals are consistent. The minimum non-residential uses for the site is consistent in terms of location with the proposed Active Street Frontages Map that is proposed to apply to the site in the *Comprehensive LEP*.

Employment Zones Reform

The Department of Planning and Environment is proposing the translation of existing Business and Industrial zones into the new Employment zones. It is proposed that the existing Business (B) and Industrial (IN) zones will be replaced with five new employment zones and three supporting zones under Standard Instrument (Local Environmental Plans) Order 2006 (SI LEP Order). These reforms are currently on exhibition in conjunction with the *Willoughby Comprehensive LEP*.

It is noted that the proposed reforms will apply to the existing B1 Neighbourhood Centre zone which applies to Lot 11 DP 611594). This zone is proposed to be replaced with the E1 Local Centre zone. A table showing the translation of existing Business and Industrial zones into the new Employment zones as it applies to the Willoughby LEP is attached (**Appendix A**).

As noted earlier the following *Schedule 1 Additional Permitted Uses* would be added to apply to this site resulting from this planning proposal:

XX Use of certain land at 100 Edinburgh Road, Castlecrag

(1) This clause applies to land at Lot 11, DP 611594 100 Edinburgh Road, Castlecrag.
(2) Development for the purpose of residential flat building is permitted with development consent if the consent authority is satisfied that:

(a) Those uses at ground level facing Edinburgh Road are used for non-residential purposes and

(b) A minimum of 20% of the total FSR is provided for non-residential purposes.

PART 3 – JUSTIFICATION

Section A- Need for the Planning Proposal

1) Is the Planning Proposal a result of any strategic study or report?

The Planning Proposal did not result from a strategic study or report.

2) Is the Planning Proposal the best means of achieving the objectives or intended outcomes, or is there a better way?

The planning proposal facilitates the use of the subject site for mixed use development for an increased building height and floor space ratio than is currently permitted within the B1 Neighbourhood Centre zone.

Section B- Relationship to strategic planning framework

3) Is the planning proposal consistent with the objectives and actions of the applicable regional or sub-regional strategy (including the Sydney Metropolitan Strategy and exhibited draft strategies)?

The planning proposal as submitted is generally consistent with the applicable metropolitan strategies. The strategic planning context of the subject site is established by various State planning documents.

The *North District Plan* includes the following statement and priorities that are relevant for the proposal:

A place-based and collaborative approach is required to maintain and enhance the liveability of the North District. This can be achieved by the following Planning Priorities:

N3. Providing services and social infrastructure to meet people's changing needs

N4. Fostering healthy, creative, culturally rich and socially connected communities

N5. Providing housing supply, choice and affordability, with access to jobs, services and public transport

N6. Creating and renewing great places and local centres, and respecting the District's heritage.

The submitted planning proposal also states that the proposal is also consistent with relevant productivity and sustainability priorities. It is however noted that the proposal will reduce the commercial space available on the site from the existing 2,552m2 to 1,740m2.

4) Is the proposal consistent with a council's local strategy or other local strategic plan?

The proposal for mixed-use development for this site is consistent with the Willoughby *Local Centres Strategy* in respect to building heights, setbacks and FSR proposed. Further discussion on consistency of the proposal with the *Strategy* is outlined earlier in this report.

It is also consistent with the *Willoughby Community Strategic Plan 2028* and the *Willoughby Local Strategic Planning Statement.* (see Planning Proposal at **Attachment 3**).

The proposal intends to provide 53 new residential housing units, which includes an apartment mix of 1 bedroom, 2 bedroom and 3 bedroom apartments (including 2 affordable housing units). This is consistent with the *Willoughby Housing Strategy to 2036*, which intends to provide additional housing in local centres including Castlecrag, in addition to achieving increased housing yields in the Chatswood CBD and existing medium and high density zoned areas which are in close proximity to centres and with good public transport links. The *Willoughby Housing Strategy to 2036 is* Council's 20 year plan to guide future housing growth in Willoughby City over this period.

A vision for future housing in Willoughby as proposed in the *Housing Strategy* includes the following:

• Willoughby values its natural environment within which it supports a wide diversity of housing to meet the needs of its residents.

• Chatswood is a confident, well designed, safe and healthy Central Business District, close to transport and open spaces providing higher density living around the commercial heart. This higher density housing has appeal for older residents who wish to be close to family and the services they need, but is also home for younger families and smaller households who also value convenience.

• St Leonards is a centre that provides a unique local character with a heritage conservation area, a bustling commercial centre, valued industrial area as well as a flourishing health and education hub all located around St Leonards Station.

• The many attractive local centres promote their distinctive characters and nurture strong communities with lower rise housing, jobs and local services. They have provided opportunities for older residents to downsize and be closer to what they need.

• The many low density heritage areas continue to contribute to Willoughby special residential character with a good supply of traditional single family homes with gardens.

• The provision of affordable housing is promoted.

The *Strategy* concluded that in terms of strategic directions the additional 6,700 dwellings in the Willoughby LGA which the forecasting information estimates to 2036 can be accommodated in the following three focus areas as follows:

• Focus area 1 to be on existing medium and high density zones, (R3 and R4) that have not as yet been developed to the full potential of the zone.

• Focus area 2 to be on the proposed B4 Mixed Use zone which surround the B3 Commercial Core of the Central Business District as identified in *The Chatswood CBD Planning and Urban Design Strategy to 2036*.

• Focus area 3 in the local centres identified in *Local Centres Strategy* as per the zoning changes proposed for Artarmon, Northbridge, East Chatswood, Penshurst Street, Castlecrag, Naremburn and Willoughby South.

The *Housing Strategy* recommends that with future development proposed increased housing yields in the Castlecrag local centre could result in a potential additional 74 dwellings (apartments) being constructed in the centre in the period to 2036.

5) Is the proposal consistent with applicable State Environmental Planning Policies?

The applicant has provided a Table highlighting consistency with relevant SEPPs that can be viewed at **Attachment 3**. It is noted that the proposal is consistent with the following SEPPs as outlined in the table below:

SEPP Title	Comment
SEPP (Resilience and Hazards) 2021	The objective of this Policy is to reduce the risk of harm to human health and the environment by ensuring that contamination and remediation are considered by planning proposal authorities. The applicant has submitted a Preliminary site investigation (PSI) which identified a number of sources of potential contamination related to previous uses. Consistent with the PSI, should a planning proposal be supported for the site, the applicant would be requested to submit a Phase 1 Contamination Assessment at development application stage. Potential contamination risk will be assessed further at development application stage.
SEPP (Transport and Infrastructure) 2021	The Planning Proposal provides for housing close to public transport and local amenities and is consistent with the Transport and Infrastructure SEPP. It is noted that an acoustic assessment will be required at development application stage given the proposed development includes residential units adjoining a major road (Eastern Valley Way) as triggered by Transport and Infrastructure SEPP.
SEPP (Building Sustainability Index - BASIX) 2004	This SEPP will apply to future proposed dwellings/units and appropriate BASIX documentation will be required with any future development application for redeveloping the site.
SEPP (Exempt and Complying Codes) 2008	The Planning Proposal does not contain provisions that contradict the application of the SEPP.

SEPP (Housing) 2021	The Planning Proposal will provide for 4% affordable housing and future development will be consistent with Council's affordable housing policies and the Housing SEPP. The Proposal will not contradict or hinder the application of the SEPP.
SEPP (Biodiversity and Conservation) 2021	The proposal will not impact on any critical habitats or threatened species as a result of the overall proposed works for the site. The proposal maintains all street trees and nearly all site trees. The project arborist has confirmed the need for the removal of four dead trees on the southern boundary. Two trees will be removed due to construction. Due to proposed additional planting, there will be a small overall increase in tree canopy at the site.
SEPP 65 – Design Quality of Residential Flat Development	This SEPP will apply to the proposed residential development. A SEPP 65 assessment has been prepared to support the planning proposal and concept plans. The plans are considered broadly consistent with the SEPP. Consistency with the SEPP 65 Apartment Design Guide (ADG) will be considered in detail at development application stage. In relation to the impact on adjoining properties, the planning proposal application has noted that the shadows to the south due to the proposal largely sit within the existing dense tree shadows at 21 June.

6) Is the planning proposal consistent with applicable Ministerial Directions (s.9.1 directions?)

The Ministerial Directions issued to councils under s.9.1 of the EP&A Act 1979 require that a planning proposal does not conflict with the Directions. The following is a summary of the planning proposal against the relevant Section 9.1 Directions.

Direction	Relevant?	Consistent?	Comment
Focus area 1: Planning Sys	stems		
1.3 Approval and Referral Requirements	Yes	Yes	The objective of this direction is to ensure that LEP provisions encourage the efficient and appropriate assessment of development.

			This is an administrative requirement for Council.
1.4 Site Specific Provisions	Yes	Yes	The Proposal involves an amendment to WLEP 2012, to amend Schedule 1 to include an additional permitted land use of "residential flat building" on the site, specifying that land uses facing Edinburgh Road at ground level should be non- residential and that a minimum of 20% of total floorspace should be non-residential uses. There are proposed corresponding amendments to allow for a site specific uplift in permissible building heights and floor space ratio. It is also proposed that Council's LEP clauses 6.8 Affordable Housing and 6.23 Design Excellence will apply to the site.

Focus area 3: Biodiversity and Conservation

3.2 Heritage Conservation	Yes	Yes	A heritage assessment has been prepared and submitted with the proposal. It is considered that the planning proposal will not impact adversely on items of heritage conservation and the adjoining Griffin heritage conservation area, provided the majority of existing trees are retained on the site and on adjoining streets.

Focus area 4: Resilience and Hazards			
Direction	Relevant?	Consistent	Comment
4.4 Remediation of Contaminated Land	Yes	Yes	The objective of this direction is to reduce the risk of harm to human health and the environment by ensuring that contamination and remediation

	1			
			are considered by planning proposal authorities.	
			The applicant has submitted a Preliminary site investigation which identified a number of sources of potential contamination related to previous uses. Contamination of the site is not expected to be encountered due to the extensive excavation of the site prior to 1979. Further excavation to a depth of about 3.8m will be subject to further detailed assessment at development application stage.	
4.5 Acid Sulfate Soils	Yes	Yes	The objective of this direction is to avoid significant adverse environmental impacts from the use of land that has a probability of containing acid sulfate soils.	
			The site is identified as Class 5 Acid Sulfate Soils risk. Given the location of the site on a ridge in an urban area, it is not anticipated that it will be impacted by acid sulfate soils. The site is located approximately 400m from Class 2 acid sulfate soils areas.	
			A future DA will be subject to the provisions of Clause 6.1 of the LEP 2012. Accordingly, detail of mitigation measures for the management of acid sulfate soils can be provided if required as part of this future development application for the redevelopment of the site.	
			The Proposal does therefore not contradict, or hinder application of the acid sulfate soils provisions in LEP 2012.	
Focus area 5: Transport and Infrastructure				
5.1 Integrating Land Use and Transport	Yes	Yes	The site is well located close to existing centres, public transport linkages and employment areas.	
			The Proposal is consistent with the objectives of Direction 5.1	

5.2 Reserving Land for Public Purposes	Yes	Yes	 due to the site's close proximity to public transport. The site's accessibility to a variety of public transport options satisfies the objectives of the direction as it reduces the dependence on private vehicles. The site exhibits good access to bus routes along Edinburgh Road and Eastern Valley Way. These provide excellent links to key centres and destinations within the lower north shore and metropolitan Sydney. The objectives of this direction are to facilitate the provision of public services and facilities by reserving land for public purposes, and to facilitate the removal of reservations of land for public purposes where the land is no longer required for acquisition. The planning proposal does not include the adjoining RE1 Public Recreation land at the rear of the site. The RE1 land (Lot 1 DP 43961) is to be retained as a public pathway linking the site through to The Postern.
Focus area 6: Housing			
6.1 Residential Zones	Yes	Yes	The site is located within an B1 Neighbourhood Centre zone. The Proposal for an additional permitted use of residential flat building on the site (ie Lot 11 DP 611594) will provide an increased mix and number of dwellings in a centre close to key infrastructure.
Focus area 7: Industry and	d Employment		
7.1 Business and Industrial Zones	Yes	Yes	The planning proposal will support continued employment generation and will support the viability of the identified local centre of Castlecrag as the proposal would allow a mixed- use development in the centre including commercial and residential uses. While the proponents state that

	employment levels wi maintained (estimated plus an estimated 15 associated with the re component of the dev the concept plan subr the proposal intends t the commercial space from the existing 2,55 1,740m2. As there is to the existing B1 Neighbourhood Centr the proposal is therefo	d 90 retail jobs sidential relopment), nitted with o reduce available 2m2 to no change e zone, ore
--	--	--

Section C- Environmental, social and economic impact

Is there any likelihood that critical habitat or threatened species, populations or ecological communities, or their habitats, will be adversely affected as a result of the proposal?

The subject site and adjoining lands have not been identified as containing any areas of critical habitat or threatened species, populations or ecological communities or habitats. The proposal intends to retain the majority of existing trees on the site.

8 Are there any other likely environmental effects as a result of the planning proposal and how are they proposed to be managed?

The following environmental impacts of the proposal and their proposed management are discussed in this report in the relevant sections above:

- Urban design including bulk and scale.
- Traffic and transport
- Heritage
- Contamination
- Stormwater and drainage
- Landscape and tree protection.
- Public domain management
- Wind impact assessment

9 Has the planning proposal adequately addressed any social and economic effects?

The Planning Proposal has adequately addressed social effects of the provision of a mixed use development on the site. It is considered that the proposal will result in economic and social benefits through the revitalisation of a key site in the Castlecrag neighbourhood centre for both commercial and residential uses. Impacts of increased building heights and FSRs on the site on adjoining uses can be managed effectively at the development application stage.

10 Is there adequate public infrastructure for the planning proposal?

The subject site is located within an established commercial area serviced by existing utilities infrastructure and public transport within the Castlecrag local centre.

The proponent has prepared a draft VPA offer showing an intention to enter into a Planning Agreement and any necessary supporting information required by Council's policy, as part of the Gateway Planning Proposal process.

Detailed consideration of the draft VPA is being undertaken and will be the subject of a separate report to Council.

11 What are the views of State and Commonwealth public authorities consulted in *accordance with the Gateway determination?*

Transport for NSW has been consulted on a previous version of the Planning Proposal and has provided a response which is addressed under Traffic and Transport section above.

PART 4 – MAPPING

This Planning Proposal involves amending the Special Provisions Area map. This includes amending the Special Provisions Area Map to show Lot 11, DP 611594 100 Edinburgh Road, Castlecrag as Area 9 (Clause 6.8 Affordable Housing applies) and Area 12 (Clause 6.23 Design Excellence applies).

Land use, height of building and the Floor Space Ratio provisions will be the subject of site specific clauses applying to the site. Specific height of building and floor space ratio maps to reference to clauses 4.3A Exceptions to height of buildings and 4.4A Exceptions to floor space ratio for additional controls will also apply to this site.

Part 5 - Community Notification

As is normal Council practice, no formal public community consultation has been undertaken by Council to date with regard to this Planning Proposal. The community will be consulted as part of the formal notification period following Gateway Determination by the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment.

PART 6 – PROJECT TIMELINE

Planning Proposal Presented to Council	November 2021
Planning Proposal submitted to Gateway	December 2021
Gateway Determination received by Council	April 2022
Community Consultation (28 days)	August 2022
Outcomes of Community Consultation presented to Council	November 2022
Planning Proposal submitted to Department requesting	December 2022
notification on Government website	

Conclusion

The Planning Proposal is considered to be generally consistent with the strategic objectives of the *Greater Sydney Region Plan* and the *North District Plan*. The Planning Proposal is also consistent with Council's *Local Centres Strategy* and *Housing Strategy* and therefore is supported in its current form.

It is considered that adequate justification has been provided for the proposed building height and floor space ratio controls that are generally consistent with those indicated in the *Strategy*. It is also noted the extensive community engagement and support that was undertaken and obtained by Council in developing and finalizing the *Strategy*.

Based on the above, it is recommended that this Planning Proposal should be forwarded to the Department of Planning, Industry and Environment, for a Gateway Determination under Section 3.34 of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979*.